Plurilingual Perspectives, Pluricultural Contexts: A case study on Agence-France Presse news coverage about the plurinational State of Bolivia in Spanish, French, and English

Natalia Rodriguez-Blanco

Department of Interpreting and Translation, University of Bologna, Italy
Correspondence: natalia.rodriguez3@unibo.it
Twitter/X: @miaulatan
ORCID: 0000-0002-0776-4279

Abstract

The present article is concerned with the multilingual news coverage from Agence-France Presse (AFP) about the South American country of Bolivia. Firstly, the theoretical and methodological approaches are outlined in order to characterise the plurality of contexts giving rise to AFP’s coverage of the Bolivian 2020 general elections. Secondly, an analysis is proposed that contrasts these multilingual versions in terms of framing devices and translation shifts, aiming at exploring the ways in which media stakeholders represent the Bolivian reality. Thirdly, the findings of this analysis are contextualised with reference to a cross-linguistic comparison of newspaper corpora. When comparing the Spanish, French, and English versions, the first two are found to be more aligned at the level of discourse patterns. The ultimate purpose of this case-study is to observe the presence of translation in plurilingual news settings, where the role of translators often goes unacknowledged within the plurality of authorship and of journalistic practices at play.

Keywords: Bolivia; Agence-France Presse; representation; translation; cross-linguistic corpus-assisted analysis; framing devices
Introduction and Definitions

Global News Agencies are a key source of journalistic coverage about events happening geographically and culturally far from their global audience, as is the case with the South American country of Bolivia. The Plurinational State of Bolivia enshrines 36 official cultures and languages. This diversity transcends Bolivian borders thanks to global media coverage in three main languages—Spanish, French, and English—of which only Spanish is officially spoken in the country. Furthermore, the portrayal of Bolivia, as an example of a remote country that is not part of mainstream discourse, is variously shaped by journalistic priorities and pressures that are not always evident to the reader, nor the researcher. It is therefore essential to seek simultaneously the multilingual and cross-cultural ‘translation’ of the country’s plurality at the textual and contextual levels.

This article aims at presenting preliminary findings deriving from the implementation of an interdisciplinary framework to investigate the locus of translation in plurilingual news production. It offers a case study about the representation of key socio-economic and political topics by Agence-France Presse news agency, as portrayed in a set of news dispatches in Spanish, French, and English, which summarized the Bolivian electoral situation in October 2020 and were intended for an international audience. A balanced focus on text and context lies at the core of the framework: the concept of Framing devices (Tankard, 2001) serves as the analytical tool to identify representative nodes of information in the multilingual versions of these news dispatches, to later contrast their textual features.

The Council of Europe (2007) defines ‘plurilingualism’ as ‘the ability to use more than one language’ by an individual or group of individuals in contrast to monolingualism. Meanwhile, ‘multilingualism’ refers to ‘the presence of several languages in a given geographical area’ (Cavalli et al., 2016: 20). In this sense, within news agencies, the notion of being ‘plurilingual’ may include the practices of news creation as well as the teams of journalists, editors, and translators involved. On the other hand, ‘multilingualism’ refers to a space where different languages coexist, where two or more languages coincide in a society, text or individual, as Grutman states (2009: 182). Given that multilingualism describes a space and plurilingualism describes a practice, this document uses ‘plurilingual’ as the overarching term describing news creation processes at news agencies, whereas ‘multilingual’ will be restricted to the analysis of the different linguistic versions of the news dispatches here analysed, where single monolingual versions of texts coexist and contrast with each other.

As concerns the role of translation, this article ultimately aims at positioning translation practices within the broader umbrella of news
production, which happens remotely, plurilingually, and almost instantaneously in the case of Global News Agencies. Inasmuch as this type of plurilingual news production entails plural authorship, it also involves translation while not necessarily acknowledging it. This article therefore also addresses the methodological complexities of this research domain and the need for converging research frameworks. Here, ‘news translation’ is a blanket term for ‘journalistic translation’, ‘press translation’ and other scholarly terms referring to the phenomenon of translation in a variety of journalistic genres (Schäffner, 2017: 328), such as news items from news agencies.

Taking on the focus of this Special Issue, Derrida’s notion of plurality invites us to ‘go beyond’ a binary notion of translation (1992), here discussed at the following two levels. First, this article analyses coexisting news dispatches in Spanish, French, and English, in a situation where the Spanish versions predate French and English versions and, presumably, the English versions derive from the Spanish and French ones. Second, the phenomenon of translation in news settings is ripe for reflection on the basic tenet of ‘equivalence’: comparability is challenged by the complexity to identify a source and a target text in a context where text production combines a multiplicity of sources and of authors (Davier & van Doorslaer, 2018: 242) that rarely carries by-lines, since the institutional source is prioritized over the individual news workers (Boyd-Barrett & Rantanen, 2000: 140).

Finally, translation in plurilingual newsrooms conveys cultural representations that transcend interlingual transfer. As Schäffner argues, the processes involved in transnational news reporting are complex and entail more than making sense of a cultural Other (2017: 331). As technology has progressed, the practices of news agencies have evolved since they became legitimate sources of international news back in the nineteenth century (Williams, 2011: 91). This enables them to efficiently circulate information across geographical, linguistic, and cultural boundaries (Schäffner, 2017) in a context where timing is pivotal.

This article covers the notion of Plurality in and about Bolivia as the context of origin in section II, along with the type of coverage it is subject of; then, section III addresses Plurality through Agence-France Presse’s (AFP) news practices; sections IV and V present theoretical and methodological concepts concerning the role of translation in news production, framing devices and cross-linguistic corpus-assisted studies; which leads to a tentative framework of analysis for news translation about culturally distant realities in section VI; section VI discusses central findings from an interdisciplinary perspective.
Plurality In and About Bolivia

Bolivia is a South American country with vast cultural and linguistic plurality. Although the country has the largest presence of indigenous people in the region the existence of 36 nations, as well as their languages and system of beliefs, was only officially recognized when the country established a new constitution in 2009, when it became the Plurinational State of Bolivia (NCPE, 2009: 4). This allowed the population to embrace their rich multicultural roots, deriving from their indigenous and Spanish origins. Since then, the Bolivian state and society have begun a national empowerment process, giving more visibility to what was formerly considered a stigma that prevailed since the colonial period: the indigenous population’s diversity of languages, cultures, and world-views. Consequently, international economic, commercial, academic, and media stakeholders have begun noticing the country at different levels.

This has brought a considerable increase in international media coverage about Bolivia at specific points in time, more particularly, during Evo Morales’ administration ‘which captured international media attention’ (Silva, 2009: 30). Reporting mostly from a general perspective, Global News Agencies—Agence-France Presse, Reuters, Associated Press, and EFE—are key sources that are later reproduced by national media outlets worldwide. Other types of more specialized coverage exist, on recent economic reforms, political analysis, and extended cultural articles, which can be found in the newspapers The News York Times and The Guardian, amongst others.

Coverage from news agencies has typically focused on hard news—timely and informative news dispatches on political and socio-economic issues (Sterling, 2009)—and soft news, featuring human-interest stories, where immediacy is not as relevant as for the first category. These categories often overlap on a practical level, melding in an inverted pyramid approach, more specially, in online media (Sterling, 2009), since political and economic concerns might intrinsically include culture-bound elements of domestic social interest. This is the case of news dispatches presenting full summaries about specific events, such as the news coverage examined here, which concerns an electoral dossier.

Plurality in AFP News Coverage

To understand the specificities of news translation, it is necessary to be aware of news agencies’ evolution. In this case, the precursor of AFP—the Agence Havas—was created in 1835 as an agency specializing in foreign affairs and international press. It is considered the world’s first Global News Agency. Back then, AFP put in place a ‘network of correspondents and translators’ (AFP, 2022), laying the groundwork for the future
structure of news agencies and the practices of journalists and translators together to produce multilingual news.

Since their locations are scattered across the globe, global news agencies have different structures and working practices. The working practices of AFP, which operates in 151 countries (AFP, 2022), vary according to regions, the amount of news coverage produced, and the size of its local ‘bureau’ or local desk – the one in La Paz, Bolivia, being rather small.

This local desk coordinates its coverage in Spanish with the Cono Sur regional desk, based in Lima, Peru. This coverage is then sent to the AFP regional headquarters in Montevideo, Uruguay. The latter office is responsible for regional content in Spanish, Portuguese, French and English (AFP, 2016) and coordinates the output of twenty-one Latin American offices (Bassnett & Bielsa, 2009). As the information is processed, its content is edited and translated into French and English by in-house desk editors at this centre. The Latin America desk in Paris also edits some dispatches, especially when the office in Uruguay is closed due to time zone differences (Ibid). Spanish is AFP’s third most important language in terms of global distribution, after French and English (Ibid: 77) and ‘Latin America is the fastest-growing region’ for AFP’s operations (AFP, 2016).

As previously mentioned, global news agencies are the major source of international news coverage about Bolivia, an example where ‘the agenda-setting role of news agencies seems undisputed’ (Davier, 2021: 184). This is precisely why the framing of their coverage and the discursive news values at stake are of utmost importance, particularly when analysing their representation of countries, events, and social actors that are geographically and culturally distant from their global audience.

Back in 1978, the UNESCO General Conference and the UN General Assembly adopted two resolutions, suggesting the need for a ‘New World Information and Communication Order’ (UNESCO, 1980), because a number of observers in the developing world felt the information flow by Western media—and international news agencies—misrepresented the ‘Third World’, as it was then termed. Reports deriving from this debate suggested that developing countries were depicted as unstable, violent, and irrational. As Williams states, ‘with neither context to give to these events nor any countervailing picture of the day-to-day life, viewers and readers were left with stereotypical images of developing societies’ (Williams, 2011: 22) and ‘where conflict is generally made the main subject’ (Martini, 2002: 2, author’s translation). Considering these agencies’ predominant agenda-setting role, one might wonder the extent to which these statements are still at play.
News Translation, Framing Devices and Cross-CaDs

The notion of equivalence has been a central concern to conceptualize translation due to its inherent contrastive nature. However, this notion was primarily based upon ‘the paradigm of the book’ (Gambier, 2021: 104), paradigm that has transformed into one that is digital and of the Web, where multiple and multimodal versions of texts coexist. News translation—and more specifically, translation at news agencies—embodies this transition into a more flexible mode of translation that goes beyond the material dimension of printed texts, traditional concepts, and translation practices. In news translation, multilingual versions of journalistic texts are available to the reader.

Both in printed and electronic media, news translators and editors face constraints in order to ensure the quality of texts, such as following in-house style preferences, where news workers ‘cannot help but rewrite, reframe, recontextualize, summarize, cut, clarify, reformulate the news with a readership in mind’ (Gambier, 2021: 103). Thus, the notions of readability and relevance are prioritized over the ones of faithfulness and fidelity to the source text. Additionally, in the news setting, translation has long-been perceived as a subaltern and invisible task that today is performed by professionals ‘whether qualified as translators or not’ (Ibid: 91).

Furthermore, digital texts are permanently updated and offered in different versions. A ‘start text’ (Pym, 2015: 68) exists, but there is no clear target text as an exclusive referent. This seems true of AFP, which not only produces news dispatches based on its previous texts, but also continually updates published texts, establishing an inherent intertextual relationship, where ‘reused’ paragraphs commonly provide recontextualized ‘background’ (Davier, 2015). This ‘uncertainty’ (Davier & Van Doorslaer, 2018) can also be found when contrasting the multilingual versions of news dispatches in an attempt to identify full equivalence with each other.

Throughout plurilingual news creation processes at news agencies, translation is instrumental to adapting texts to the needs of a very heterogeneous worldwide audience. This is likely to require not only reorganizing and contextualizing information, but also rewriting the news dispatches in order to enhance the comprehensibility and effectiveness of the original text for the new context(s) that may be culturally and geographically distant from that of the texts’ origin.

Moreover, journalists at news agencies make the unfamiliar familiar to their audiences on a regular basis. As Williams argues, ‘crossing cultural barriers and interpreting cultural difference is central to the activity of foreign correspondence’ (Williams: 2011, 42). In much the same way, the
effects of technological progress in the transformations of media and the profession of journalism ‘are not without analogy with the transformations of translator’s work’ (Gambier, 2021: 92), which are accelerated in digital settings.

In general terms, previous studies on translation at news agencies suggest there is common ground about the values guiding the journalists’ work, the relative absence of translators at newswires, and the coexistence of seemingly contradictory practices, namely, rewriting and literal translation (Davier, 2021). In AFP’s multilingual coverage, Bassnett and Bielsa identified the conventionalized Inverted Pyramid structure in news agencies’ style is conserved in the translation process (2009). They also found the following recurrent translation strategies: change of title, omissions/deletions, additions/clarifications, recombination, and reordering/rearrangement of paragraphs.

Likewise, the literature on translation strategies points out that, in order to meet the expectations of a plural and global readership, explicitation and specification often occur in the case of source-culture-specific referents with regards to realia, names of politicians and places (Schäffner, 2017). As we will see, this point is particularly relevant to this article.

In terms of stylistic conventions, news typology, and textual structure at stake, the agencies’ guidelines and media literature seem insightful, for instance, about the use of the ‘inverted pyramid model’, a convention institutionalized in journalism (Palmer, 1998; Franklin, 2005) and at global agencies (Davier, 2017: 107), that contrasts with a chronological report of the events. This model ‘is ideally suited to the fundamental principles of speed and hierarchy (...) in which the elements of the story are written up in declining order of importance, so that essential information comes first and is developed in subsequent paragraphs, which add background information’ (Bielsa & Bassnett, 2009: 69).

Moving on to media studies, based on contributions by Goffman (1974) on Frame analysis, a number of framing theorists have claimed that the media frame reality and shapes the way people ‘should think’ about an issue (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000), by giving salience to certain aspects of it, thus being active in constructing such reality (Zanettin, 2021). Accordingly, Framing refers to ‘how’ we understand an event by virtue of emphasizing some elements over others (de Vreese, 2005), where certain parts of news texts are focal points that contain frames and function as central nodes of information.

More specifically, Tankard (2001: 100) proposed a comprehensive typology of Framing devices to identify common frames in news:
headlines, subheads, leads, source selection, quotes selection, concluding statements and concluding paragraphs. These elements seem pertinent to study variation in the translation of Framing devices, such as headlines and leads, since they reach a broader range of readers than the texts that accompany them (Riggs, 2021), especially considering the global readership of international news.

Caimotto and Gaspari argue that given the important ‘amount of interlinguistic and intercultural editing’ (2018: 213) present in translated news texts, cross-fertilizing studies on news translation with close disciplines might prove useful to analyse key issues concerning translation, multilingualism, and journalistic discourse. In this sense, Cross-linguistic Corpus-assisted Discourse Studies (Cross-CaDS) may support triangulation when studying discourse patterns beyond cultural and linguistic boundaries (Taylor & Marchi, 2018), where a dialogue with translation studies is central. Thus, using corpora can inform translation studies by focusing on specific linguistic patterns present in translated texts ‘with respect to comparable non-translated texts’ (Bernardini, 2022: 489) in the target language.

Consequently, the identification of Framing devices, coupled with a Cross-CaDS perspective (Taylor & Del Fante, 2020; Partington, 2004, 2006) may provide a method for studying representational aspects present in multilingual coverage. Here, the notion of semantic preference is central to understand the relation of certain lexical items and frequent sets of semantically related words, where collocational patterning (Bednarek, 2008) shows associations, connotations, and assumptions these items embody and the how readers may be ‘primed’ about represented groups (Stubbs, 1996: 172)

Methods

The dossier (Laville, 2007) of full summaries here analysed was published by AFP and covers the topic of the 2020 Bolivian general elections. It reflects the blurring distinction between hard and soft news: it provides general background of the country; economic, electoral, and socio-political analysis; a depiction of the main presidential candidates and the vote results; and direct quotes from local citizens. It summarized these different angles in the span of five days surrounding the actual event (the Election Day), namely, between the 15\textsuperscript{th} and the 19\textsuperscript{th} of October, 2020. It includes 20 dispatches in Spanish, 11 in French, and 9 in English, from which 5 multilingual news dispatches published in Spanish, French, and English were selected (i.e., 15 parallel texts) since they were available in the three languages and had temporal, taxonomic, and thematic correspondence. They were accessed through the Nexis Uni database.
The selection of this dataset endeavours two purposes: first, to observe and contrast the multilingual coverage in terms of translation and, second, to inform a study corpus (SC) to explore concrete discursive aspects that will be later contrasted in a reference corpus (RC). Thus, this article considers first each linguistic version independently—in Spanish, French, and English—by means of close reading, in order to observe its structural features. Then, paratextual evidence (Batchelor, 2018) surrounding each news dispatch is considered, i.e. precise time and date of publication in order to track down the multilingual versions’ genesis. Next, central nodes of information are selected via the above-mentioned typology of Framing devices (Tankard, 2001).

The second stage focuses on the depiction of Bolivia and of social actors, by examining the relationships between their discursive construction and potential newsworthiness when framed in salient textual segments within the news dispatches’ multilingual versions. Here local translation choices across the texts are analysed from a Cross-CaDS perspective.

For this, a list of recurring terms that represent Bolivia and social actors are identified across the study corpus built with the 5 sets of the multilingual versions (i.e. 5 corresponding news dispatches in Spanish, French, and English) as a starting point. Then, these recurring terms in the Framing devices are examined in journalistic reference corpora—as an external point— to identify typical discursive patterns surrounding them. The reference corpus that supports the analysis is the Timestamped JSI (2014-2021) web corpora of online journalistic texts in Spanish, French, and English (containing 16 billion, 6 billion, and 60 billion words, respectively), accessed via the SketchEngine platform (Bušta & Herman, 2017).

To explore the use of these lexical items in the concordance lines and collocations surrounding them, the Corpus Query Language function (CQL) on SketchEngine is run in separate searches in Spanish, French and English. The query for one recurring term involves conducting three queries—one in each language—to make the discursive analysis supported by reference corpora concise.

Analysis

Table 1 below shows the multilingual versions of headlines from all news dispatches considered in this case-study on AFP’s multilingual dossier on Electoral coverage. The analysis aims, first, to trace the genesis of these multilingual versions and, second, to show a relationship of the type of translation shifts in Framing devices, albeit in a cursory manner due to
space limitations. At the same time, though no generalizing claims can be drawn resulting from these brief observations, they may indicate the presence of translation across corresponding texts intended for different audiences. The same criteria are applied to one example about the representation of Bolivia and one of social actors in sections A) and B) to support the discursive analysis with empirical evidence from journalistic reference corpora.

Table 1: Multilingual Headlines from AFP.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Multilingual Headlines</th>
<th>Language and Time of Publication</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Bolivia, el país de América con mayor cantidad de indígenas</td>
<td>ES - October 15, 2020 7:18 PM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bolivie: un des pays du continent à la plus forte proportion d'Amérindiens</td>
<td>FR - October 16, 2020 5:05 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bolivia: Turmoil in Latin America's indigenous heartland</td>
<td>EN - October 16, 2020 10:10 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Bolivia golpeada por la pandemia y la economía vuelve a las urnas</td>
<td>ES - October 15, 2020 3:14 PM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Les Boliviens rappelés aux urnes après l'échec du scrutin présidentiel de 2019</td>
<td>FR - October 16, 2020 4:45 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bolivia set to vote for president after polarized campaign</td>
<td>EN - October 16, 2020 5:31 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Mesa y Arce cierran en Bolivia campaña electoral polarizada por la figura de Evo</td>
<td>ES - October 15, 2020 2:18 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Demiers meetings de campagne pour l'élection présidentielle en Bolivie</td>
<td>FR - October 15, 2020 3:56 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Socialist candidate Arce riding on Morales popularity</td>
<td>EN - October 16, 2020 8:12 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Candidato de Evo Morales se impone en primera vuelta de presidenciales de Bolivia</td>
<td>ES - October 19, 2020 5:14 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bolivie : Luis Arce, dauphin d'Evo Morales, vainqueur de la présidentielle</td>
<td>FR - October 19, 2020 5:29 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bolivia 'has recovered democracy' says Arce as exit poll suggests win</td>
<td>EN - October 19, 2020 8:30 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Presidenta interina de Bolivia pide &quot;paciencia&quot; por lentitud de escrutinio electoral</td>
<td>ES - October 18, 2020 11:15 PM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bolivie: la présidente demande de la &quot;patience&quot; devant la lenteur des résultats</td>
<td>FR - October 19, 2020 00:40 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Outgoing president calls for Bolivia patience with slow vote count</td>
<td>EN - October 19, 2020 08:00 AM GMT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As datelines in Table 1 suggest, the three versions of each set were published within 15 hours of each other. The Spanish versions are published first, followed by the French ones, then followed by the English ones. Based on this paratextual evidence only, we might argue that English is the final target text, deriving from the Spanish and French versions, whereas French is based solely on the Spanish versions.

As for the textual features of these multilingual headlines, the Spanish and French versions appear to remain closer to each other in all examples, whereas headlines 1 and 3 in English show traces both from the Spanish and French versions. Equally, the English versions appear to add evaluative information that goes beyond the descriptive headlines that characterize the Spanish and French versions. From a translational perspective, we may argue the language of headlines ‘is heavily mediated and recontextualized’ by ‘traseditors’ that render them (Zhang in Riggs, 2021: 353) in a process of multilingual news production marked by plural authorship.
**Representation of Bolivia**

With this background on translation strategies embedded in this multilingual news coverage in mind, this section draws on the use of the reference corpora on SketchEngine to support the analysis of recurring discursive patterns found in the study corpora. Framing devices allowed us to identify one representation of Bolivia that appears to be central in the English study corpus, firstly, along with its equivalents in the French and Spanish versions. We focus on the word ‘landlocked’, the most frequent description of Bolivia in the English texts (in four out of five) within framing devices. It appears 6 times and is positioned in salient parts of the texts, *e.g.*, first word of leads, first word of paragraphs, subheads, and closing statements. The functionally equivalent terms in French, ‘Enclavé’ [*landlocked*], and in Spanish, ‘Sin salida al mar’ [*without access to sea*], appear only in one corresponding text in subheads and subsequently paraphrased. Due to this prevalence of ‘landlocked’ in the English texts, the following results will be displayed first in English rather than in Spanish.

The six appearances of ‘Landlocked’ in the English texts are listed in **Table 2**, along with the two occurrences of the equivalent terms in the French and Spanish. The first three examples in English depicting Bolivia as a landlocked country are related to evaluative pieces of information, such as it being a poor country despite its rich natural resources (repeated in two texts), it being home to the largest indigenous population, or it being shadowed by the landlocked country’s first ever indigenous president, references that do not entail an obvious positive or negative evaluation. Meanwhile, the fourth and fifth examples rather objectively describe geographical aspects of the country in all three languages. These renditions seem closer to the content of the source(s), as would be the case in more standard translation practice. It is therefore worth considering the effect of choosing ‘landlocked’ as the equivalent of ‘enclavé’ and ‘sin salida al mar’. To do so, we will describe how these expressions are generally used (and consequently, understood) in the three languages.
Table 2: Contrasted occurrences of ‘landlocked’, ‘enclavé’ and ‘sin salida al mar’ in SC.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Bit of text</th>
<th>Text No.</th>
<th>Framing device</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>1. “Landlocked Bolivia, (…) is home to one of the largest indigenous populations in Latin America”</td>
<td>No.1</td>
<td>Lead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. “Yet not only does the shadow of the landlocked country’s first ever indigenous president loom large over the poll (…)”</td>
<td>No.2</td>
<td>Lead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. “Landlocked Bolivia, one of the poorest countries in the region despite its rich natural resources (…)”</td>
<td>Nos. 4, 5</td>
<td>Closing statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. “Landlocked and forested”</td>
<td>No.1</td>
<td>Subhead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. “(…) now sits landlocked, bordered by Brazil (…)”</td>
<td>No.1</td>
<td>Subhead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>French</td>
<td>1. “Pays enclavé et boisé [Landlocked and forested]”</td>
<td>No.1</td>
<td>Subhead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. “La Bolivie (1,098,581 km²) est enclavée entre le Brésil (…)” [Bolivia (1,098,581 km²) is landlocked between Brazil (…)]</td>
<td>No.1</td>
<td>Subhead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>1. “Sin salida al mar [Without access to sea]”</td>
<td>No.1</td>
<td>Subhead</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. “Bolivie (1,098,581 km²) está enclavada entre Brasil, (…) sin salida directa al mar para sus productos” [Bolivia (1,098,581 km²) is landlocked between Brazil, (…) without direct access to the sea for its products]</td>
<td>No.1</td>
<td>Subhead</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Equivalent CQLs were run on reference corpora to explore the functional equivalents ‘Landlocked’, ‘Enclavé’, and ‘Sin salida al mar’ followed by a proper noun within an optional span of 3 words and excluding results that contained the terms county, town, city, province, and valley in all three languages. These queries were devised to identify the expressions in question in the vicinity of proper nouns referring to countries, nations, or states.

Out of 21,852 results in English, the most frequent countries co-occurring with ‘Landlocked’ are: Afghanistan, Nepal, Laos, Uganda, Bolivia, Zambia, Zimbabwe, Armenia, and Ethiopia. These results reveal two relevant points. First, Bolivia is ranked fifth in terms of co-occurrence (with 298 results), representing a frequency of more than 1%. Second, these co-occurrences show that the descriptor ‘landlocked’ is typically applied to countries in Asia, Africa, and South America. However, 45 nations worldwide are officially landlocked (Khanal, 2017): 16 in Africa, 15 in Europe, 12 in Asia, and 2 in South America (Bolivia and Paraguay). It can be concluded that European countries are less often represented as landlocked in English journalistic texts, even though they represent one third of ‘landlocked’ countries.

Out of 1,818 results in French, the countries that typically co-occur with the equivalent term ‘Enclavé’ are: Afrique de l’Ouest, Mali, Tchad, Burkina Faso, Gambie, Ethiopie, Lesotho, Rwanda, Niger, Botswana, Malawi, Burundi, Zambie, Bolivie, and Paraguay. Here, African countries appear most frequently, followed by the two South American nations. Bolivia co-occurs with this adjective 19 times, about 1% of the results.
Out of 222 results in Spanish, the equivalent term ‘Sin salida al mar’ most frequently co-occurs with the following countries: Bolivia, Paraguay, Malawi, Africa Occidental, Etiopía, Uganda, Armenia, and Burkina Faso. Bolivia ranks first (followed by Paraguay), with 42 occurrences, or around 19% hits, a sizeable difference if compared to the results in English and French. One could conclude that the results in French and Spanish journalistic texts show a strong relationship of co-occurrence with the regions and countries that were formerly colonies of France and Spain, respectively. The same cannot be said of the texts in English.

These initial queries were then filtered to study the type of adjectives modifying these search terms within a context of 3 words around them. In the case of ‘Landlocked’, the 10 most frequent adjectives are: mountainous, least-developed, energy-rich, land-linked, war-devastated, better-known, small, poor, geographical, and remote. Meanwhile, ‘Enclavé’ co-occurs with the adjectives petit [small], anglophone, australe, pauvre [poor], désertique, dépendent, rurale, montaigneux [mountainous], minuscule, and vulnerable. Finally, ‘Sin salida al mar’ co-occurs with the adjectives posible, montañoso, pequeño [small], interior, soberano [sovereign], andino [Andean], pobre [poor], and democrático. Thus, references to poverty, size, and topography seem prevalent across corpora in all three languages.

Since the JSI-Timestamped corpus in English is substantially larger than the other two, a specific further search was conducted restricting it to adjectives co-occurring with ‘Landlocked’ and ‘Bolivia’. Taking into account the right- and left-side co-text, the most frequent adjectives that modify ‘Bolivia’ are: direct, poor, poorest, impoverished, small, smallest, indigenous, rich, lithium-rich, potato-rich, copper-rich, subtropical, and naval. While a few words in this list refer to neutral geographical notions (e.g., coastal, subtropical, and naval), most match the semantic field where ‘landlocked’ appears in AFP analysed texts, which could be summarized as referring to poverty (in general) and richness (in natural resources). Nonetheless, the presence of ‘indigenous’ here and in the texts under analysis is especially surprising, since the word does not appear to fall into either semantic field.

**Representation of social actors**

The second category of analysis concerns the representation of social actors, more specifically, the main electoral candidates across this AFP’s multilingual dossier. The five multilingual news dispatches analysed here focused on three main social actors: Evo Morales (106 mentions–former Bolivian president until 2019, MAS Party, left-wing), Luis Arce (77 mentions–2020 candidate for MAS Party, left-wing) and Carlos Mesa (43 mentions–2020 candidate for CC Party, centre-right). Even though
mentions of Morales greatly outnumber mentions of Arce and Mesa, these were not considered since Morales was not in fact a candidate in 2020.

On the one hand, the electoral candidate Luis Arce is mostly described across texts with the multilingual equivalent epithets of ‘delfín de Evo Morales’, ‘dauphin d’Evo Morales’, ‘heir to Morales’, in Spanish, French, and English respectively, with slight variations in its phrasing, as shown below in Table 3. The most common wording in Spanish and French is ‘delfín de’ and ‘dauphin de’, respectively, followed by Evo Morales’ partial or full name, the title former president, or preceded by the personal pronouns su and son [his dauphin]. Yet, the French versions show more repetitions across texts, while the Spanish versions display more variation, e.g., ‘su hombre’ [his man] and ‘candidato de Morales’ [Morales’ candidate]. Meanwhile, the English texts use more metaphors, like ‘hand-picked successor’, ‘Arce riding on Morales’ popularity’, and direct quotes from other political actors that depict him as ‘cashier of waste’ and ‘puppet of the dictator Morales’.

As van Leeuwen argues (1996), the representation of social actors deals with their inherent agency—in sociological or linguistic terms—by conferring on them the roles of agents or patients. A social actor may be passivated, more specifically, subjected, by linguistic means when treated as an object (van Leeuwen, 1996: 44). Under this category, depicting the electoral candidate Arce as ‘puppet of the dictator Morales’ in English and ‘delfín de’ or ‘dauphin de’ followed by ‘Morales’ in Spanish and French exemplify a possesivation (ibid: 44), where the prepositional phrases with ‘of’ relegate the actor’s agency to a passive role.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Luis Arce (MAS Party)</th>
<th>Carlos Mesa (CC Party)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>1. delfín de Evo [dauphin of Evo]</td>
<td>1. el exmandatario centrista Carlos Mesa [centrist former head of state Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. delfín del presidente [dauphin of former president]</td>
<td>2. el expresidente Carlos Mesa [former president Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. delfín de Morales [dauphin of Morales]</td>
<td>3. el centrista Carlos Mesa [centrist Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. su delfín [his dauphin]</td>
<td>4. el ex presidente centriste Carlos Mesa [centrist former president Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. su hombre [his man]</td>
<td>5. l’ex presidente centriste Carlos Mesa [centrist former president Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. candidato de Evo Morales [candidate of Evo Morales]</td>
<td>1. un ancien président de la Bolivie [former Bolivian president]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. “Arce no es otra cosa que Morales” [Arce is nothing but Morales]</td>
<td>2. le centriste Carlos Mesa [centrist Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>French</td>
<td>1. dauphin d’Evo Morales [dauphin of Evo Morales]</td>
<td>3. l’ex président Carlos Mesa [former president Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. son dauphin [his dauphin]</td>
<td>4. l’ancien président centriste Carlos Mesa [centrist former president Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. dauphin de l’ancien chef de l’Etat Evo Morales [dauphin of former head of state Evo Morales]</td>
<td>5. l’ex président centriste Carlos Mesa [centrist former president Carlos Mesa]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. “Arce n’est rien d’autre chose que Morales” [Arce is nothing but Morales]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English</td>
<td>1. the leftist heir to Morales</td>
<td>1. centrist former president Carlos Mesa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. his hand-picked successor</td>
<td>2. centrist Carlos Mesa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Socialist candidate Arce riding on Morales’ popularity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. has campaigned on his record as Morales’ minister</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. but owes his popularity to his mentor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. “cashier of waste”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. “a puppet of the dictator Morales”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Contrasted Representation of Social Actors in SC.
Another representation of Arce in Spanish and French is a direct quote from the rival candidate Mesa, where he mentions ‘Arce no es otra cosa que Morales’ and ‘Arce n’est rien d’autre chose que Morales’ [Arce is nothing but Morales]. Not only does this reinforce the depiction of Arce as being subject to Morales and lacking agency; it also provides Mesa with an advantageous platform, legitimizing a negative evaluation about his electoral rival. The representations of Arce as ‘nothing but Morales’ or ‘a puppet of the dictator’ are at odds with AFP’s ethics charter for electoral coverage, which advises caution with regards to defamatory remarks (including insults or rumours), especially those spread by one candidate about another. Whenever this type of remark is reported, ‘it must be put into context and the person concerned must have a chance to respond to it.’ (AFP, 2016: 11, author’s translation).

On the other hand, the representation of the electoral candidate Carlos Mesa remains similar across the three versions. The phrase ‘centrist former president Carlos Mesa’ in English translates to ‘el exmandatario centrista Carlos Mesa’ in Spanish and ‘l’ex président centriste Carlos Mesa’ in French. These depictions repeat across most texts in Spanish, French, and English with slight nearly synonymous variations, i.e., by using head of state or president, or by removing this title. Then, we can tentatively conclude that fewer translation shifts occur when the social actor being described is less newsworthy.

For the second phase of the analysis and given their frequent use of the equivalent terms ‘delfín de’, ‘dauphin de’ [dauphin of], and ‘heir to’ on the study corpora, these were run with multilingual CQLs on journalistic reference corpora. These expressions were sought when followed by a proper noun within a span of 4 intervening words. The main results in each language are shown in Tables 4, 5 and 6, respectively. Out of 4,443 results in Spanish, the lexical item ‘delfín de’ is most frequently followed by Evo Morales, Rafael Correa, and Lula da Silva (former left-wing South American presidents). Amongst the most frequent collocations, five refer to politicians from South America (Nos. 1, 2, 3, 6, 7), three to European politicians (Nos. 4, 5, 8), and one to a soccer entrepreneur (No. 9).
Out of 17,405 results in French, the equivalent phrase ‘dauphin de’ is typically followed by the proper nouns *Paris Saint-Germain* (representing a large majority), *Joseph Kabila* and *Bayern Munich*. Amongst the most frequent collocations, the overall results are predominantly sport-related, referring to soccer teams (Nos. 1, 3, 5, 6, 7), to a cyclist (No. 4) and to a tennis player (No. 8). Two results refer to politicians (Nos. 2, 9), one being African (Joseph Kabila) and one South American (Evo Morales).

Out of 61,418 results in English, the term ‘heir to’ predominantly precedes the proper nouns ‘Iron Throne’ and ‘British throne/crown’, in table 6. The former refers to a fictional throne (from the Game of Thrones TV Series) and the latter to the British monarchy. Notably less frequent, the remaining collocates may be grouped as enterprises (Nos. 3, 6, 7, 8) or renown individuals (Nos. 5, 9).
This brief yet detailed contrastive analysis supported by journalistic reference corpora shows that, on the one hand, ‘heir to’ and ‘dauphin de’, in English and French, hold a semantic preference for enterprises and sports, as well as the monarchy itself, and that politicians are not commonly described as such, except for Evo Morales and Joseph Kabila. On the other hand, the Spanish equivalent ‘delfín de’ most commonly describes politicians, more specifically, left-wing South American leaders. It might be argued that Spanish readers are more often exposed to this depiction of a leader’s successor than English and French readers. This might shed light about decision-making during the ‘transediting’ (Stetting, 1989) process for these multilingual news dispatches.

Discussion

This contrastive textual analysis forms the backdrop for the findings about translation. As scholars in this subfield of research commonly claim, a crucial methodological constraint is the difficulty of identifying source and target texts (Valdeón, 2015, Davier & Van Doorslaer, 2018) because news dispatches are multi-authored and continuously updated, what Hernández Guerrero considers ‘unstable’ sources (2009, 43). Nevertheless, the analysis of this dossier suggests that it is possible to trace corresponding texts within a controlled number of news pieces by the same agency, though this is a time-consuming, painstaking task. These multilingual news dispatches have topical, temporal, taxonomic, and textual correspondence. They usually have matching blocks of information and framing devices.

Yet, it is possible to assert that texts vary at the macro-structure, involving the strategies of title change, reordering of paragraphs, deletions, and additions. Once reorganized, the information ‘reused’ within news dispatches from the same dossier is translated almost literally, with local additions and explicitations, especially in contextual background paragraphs. This continuum of major and minor intervention shows that
‘equivalent’ translated paragraphs can very often be traced in the different linguistic versions, especially in the combination Spanish and French, which seem to be closely interrelated.

By tracing the datelines of the multilingual versions, as well as matching paragraphs, it was observed that the resulting English versions tend to derive from both the Spanish (first text) and the French versions (second text), incorporating several additions that go beyond contextualization and seem to involve a significant number of evaluative statements, as was shown in the analysis of headlines and representations of Bolivia and social actors. These evaluative statements may ultimately lead to a text that elicits opinions and values that differ from those in the starting text. This crucial aspect makes it relevant to intersect translation and corpus analysis when studying news translation.

Additionally, studying the plurilingual genealogy of the news dispatches might be a promising approach, especially considering the English versions, which seem to derive from two source texts at the same time (Spanish and French) and point to a particular translation phenomenon. In the same vein, Baker argues that translation should no longer be considered the reproduction of a stable, bounded ‘original’, but should be ‘re-conceptualized as an ongoing rewriting of an already pluralized “original”’ (Baker cited in Baer, 2016) as is the case of the multiple sources for each multilingual version analysed in this article.

Conclusion

The present case study on AFP’s news production about Bolivia found plurality at different levels. First, the multilingual versions of each news dispatch may be understood as a net of coexisting texts, which point to a flexible process underlying the creation and publication of news texts. This is because paragraphs in the different languages are selected, re-used, and rewritten through texts published sequentially and that draw from the analysed dossier, whether in the same language or translated into another language (e.g., Spanish as the source, followed by the French version and later by the English one, which presumably derives from the previous two).

A process of plural authorship is thus established, where news translators and editors from different desks publish their multilingual versions for a plurality of readers, prioritizing information relevant to each version. Here, Framing devices are central to analysing how news content is organized – especially which information is selected, emphasized, or excluded (Tankard et al., 1991) in the multilingual versions. The examples in this article show that headlines carry salient information and construct the
newsworthiness of the issue being represented, where translation shifts bring key variations, especially in the English versions when compared to the Spanish and French ones, which seem to interrelate closely.

Translation thus goes hand in hand with journalistic functions in multilingual news production, although the role of translators is not openly acknowledged. As van Doorslaer states, in journalism ‘the role of the author in the discursive variation of representation is a fundamental feature’, context in which news translators are cultural mediators (2021: 209) and can be considered ‘gatekeepers’ (Valdeón, 2020, Hursti, 2001).

In addition to the methodological difficulties mentioned in sections V and VI, researchers have limited access to the news organizations (Boyd-Barrett & Palmer 1981) in order to be able to triangulate findings from contrastive analysis of multilingual coverage with the perspectives from journalists about the news coverage they produce. As Davier argues, this limited access may partly explain the small number of studies about news agencies in general and, particularly, translation at those agencies (Davier, 2021). However, triangulation with journalistic reference corpora can support textual and translational analysis to study specific text excerpts by contrasting the analysed news pieces to larger sets of texts to find discursive patterns. This might be one way to converge interdisciplinary frameworks to elucidate multilingual journalistic choices and facilitate future research in translation.

Finally, the choice of multilingual news coverage about Bolivia aimed at studying journalistic discourse about a specific context that does not pertain to mainstream discourse, which transcends geographic and linguistics boundaries to become global. Representation about a plurinational and diverse country brings a unique value for translation studies by broadening the range of data available—especially, when in relation to culturally-bound texts—to be explored in further research in this evolving domain of study.
Natalia Rodriguez Blanco is a PhD student at the University of Bologna (Italy) in Interpreting, Translation, and Intercultural Studies. She earned her master’s degree in Interpreting and Translation Studies from Wake Forest University (USA) and her bachelor’s degree in Applied Linguistics from San Simon University (Bolivia). Her research interests derive from her own experience as a professional interpreter, translator, and intercultural mediator (ES/FR/EN) for national, international, and diplomatic institutions, primarily, based in Bolivia. Her doctoral research project comprehends the areas of translation, multilingual news production, sociocultural representation, and discourse analysis in global news agencies. Her research intersects approaches from translation, corpus studies, and ethnographic work.

List of Tables

Table 1: Multilingual Headlines from AFP.

Table 2: Contrasted occurrences of 'landlocked', 'enclavé' and 'sin salida al mar' in SC.

Table 3: Contrasted Representation of social actors in SC.

Table 4: Top results of collocates to ‘delfín de’ + proper noun in Spanish.

Table 5: Top results of collocates 'dauphin de' + proper noun in French.

Table 6: Top results of collocates 'heir to' + proper noun in English.

References


**News dispatches from Agence-France Presse considered in this article**


Exchanges: The Interdisciplinary Research Journal

---


---


---


---


---

— 2020m. Presidenta interina de Bolivia pide "paciencia" por lentitud de escrutinio electoral. Agence France Presse -- Spanish, October 19.

---


---

— 2020o. Outgoing president calls for Bolivia patience with slow vote count. Agence France Presse -- English, October 19.

---

To cite this article: